

APPENDICES

APPENDIX A

An online questionnaire for preliminary needs analysis on English writing for international publication

Thank you for participating in this survey. This questionnaire is only to serve my thesis project, so your privacy will be fully protected. Please answer honestly, and share your genuine opinions, especially with the open-ended questions.

1. What is your current academic position?
 - Master's degree
 - PhD
2. How many years have you been involved in academic research?
 - Less than 2 years
 - 2-5 years
 - 5-10 years
 - More than 10 years
3. What is your primary field of research?
 - Banking
 - Finance
 - Economics
 - Business
 - Other (please specify)
4. How would you rate your proficiency in English for academic writing?
 - Beginner
 - Intermediate
 - Advanced
 - Native-like
5. Which areas of English language proficiency do you find most challenging? (Select all that apply)
 - Grammar
 - Vocabulary
 - Writing style and coherence
 - Structuring arguments
 - Understanding and using jargon
 - Other (please specify)
6. How often do you write research articles in English?

- Rarely
 - Occasionally
 - Frequently
 - Always
7. What are the main challenges you face when writing research articles in English? (Select all that apply)
- Difficulty expressing complex ideas
 - Lack of familiarity with academic writing conventions
 - Problems with grammar and syntax
 - Limited vocabulary
 - Receiving negative feedback on English proficiency
 - Other (please specify)
8. Have you ever received training or attended workshops on academic writing in English?
- Yes
 - No
9. If yes, how helpful did you find these training sessions or workshops?
- Not helpful
 - Somewhat helpful
 - Helpful
 - Very helpful
10. What types of support do you currently have for improving your academic writing in English? (Select all that apply)
- Writing workshops
 - Language editing services
 - Peer review and feedback
 - Mentorship
 - Access to academic writing resources (e.g., books, online courses)
 - Other (please specify)
 - None
11. What additional support or resources would help you improve your academic writing in English? (Select all that apply)
- More writing workshops
 - Better access to language editing services
 - Increased opportunities for peer review and feedback
 - Mentorship from experienced researchers

- Comprehensive academic writing resources
 - Other (please specify)
12. How confident do you feel about your ability to publish research articles in high-impact international journals?
- Not confident
 - Somewhat confident
 - Confident
 - Very confident
13. Do you believe that improving your English proficiency would significantly enhance your research publication success?
- Strongly disagree
 - Disagree
 - Neutral
 - Agree
 - Strongly agree
14. What specific topics or areas do you feel need more research to support Vietnamese researchers in academic writing?
- Effective strategies for overcoming language barriers
 - The impact of socio-cultural factors on writing practices
 - The role of mentorship and peer support in improving writing skills
 - The effectiveness of different types of writing support resources
 - Other (please specify)
15. Please provide any additional comments or suggestions on how to support Vietnamese researchers in improving their academic writing in English.

APPENDIX B

Sources of data

30 Vietnamese-based research articles

VNRAs	References
VNRA01	Nguyen, H. M., Pham, H. T. N., Tran, K. M., Nguyen, M. T. T., & Nguyen, Y. T. H. (2025). Digitalization and its impact on commercial banks' profitability in Vietnam. <i>Ho Chi Minh City Open University Journal of Science-Economics and Business Administration</i> , 15(1), 152-164.
VNRA02	Uong, L. T. N., & Nguyen, N. D. (2025). The disclosure of ESG reports of SMEs in the emerging market. <i>Ho Chi Minh City Open University Journal of Science-Economics and Business Administration</i> , 15(3), 107-123.
VNRA03	Khuc, N. D. (2024). The effects of leader-member exchange on employee performance at commercial banks in Ho Chi Minh City: The role of job satisfaction and work engagement as mediating variables. <i>Ho Chi Minh City Open University Journal of Science-Economics and Business Administration</i> , 14(4), 129-139.
VNRA04	Minh, N. T. B., & Nam, K. D. (2023). Application of ISS Model for individual customer satisfaction: A study of Internet Banking and Mobile Banking services in Ho Chi Minh City, Vietnam. <i>Ho Chi Minh City Open University Journal of Science-Economics and Business Administration</i> , 13(2), 114-128.
VNRA05	Thao, N. D. T., & Tri, H. M. (2024). How socio-demographic factors affect the personal finance management application assessment during the Covid period in Vietnam?. <i>Ho Chi Minh City Open University Journal of Science-Economics and Business Administration</i> , 14(1), 3-19.
VNRA06	Nguyen, M. T. B., Khuc, N. D., & Nguyen, N. H. (2024). The direct and indirect impacts of factors on the use of QR code payment during the Covid-19 pandemic: Empirical research in Ho Chi Minh City, Vietnam. <i>Ho Chi Minh City Open University Journal of Science-Economics and Business Administration</i> , 14(2), 126-142.
VNRA07	Le, P. L., Ta, T. N., Pham, N. A., & Le, T. Y. O. (2024). What can make changes to Vietnamese state-owned commercial banks' profitability? <i>Journal of Finance and Accounting Research</i> , 6(31), 66-70.
VNRA08	Ha, V. S., Nguyen, T. B. H., & Nguyen, K. L. (2024). Leveraging financial technology for sustainable development: an empirical analysis. <i>Journal of Finance and Accounting Research</i> , 4(29), 62-66.
VNRA09	Tran, T. T., & Le, T. H. (2025). The moderating effect of operational performance on the relationship between quality management and corporate financial performance: evidence from listed food manufacturing companies in Vietnam. <i>Journal of Finance and Accounting Research</i> , 2(33), 61-65.

VNRAs	References
VNRA10	Nguyen, T. H. H., Nguyen, L. H. N., Vu, K. L., & Ha, P. T. (2024). The impact of corporate carbon trading on firm performance: evidence from clean development mechanism in Vietnam. <i>Journal of Finance and Accounting Research</i> , 2(27), 74-77.
VNRA11	Nguyen, M. A., Trinh, H. D., Tran, T. M. T, Tran, Q. A., Nguyen, M. D., & Nguyen, D. H. (2024). The effect of capital structure on the operational efficiency of listed processing and manufacturing enterprises in Vietnam. <i>Journal of Finance and Accounting Research</i> , 6(31), 123-126.
VNRA12	Bui, N. M. P., & Dang, V. D. (2024). The impact of cash flow and financial constraints on investment of listed firms in Vietnam. <i>Journal of Finance and Accounting Research</i> , 5(30), 44-49.
VNRA13	Cuong, N. M., Anh, N. H., Anh, V. H., & Tien, N. Q. (2024). Access to credit for real estate transactions in emerging markets-Empirical evidence from Vietnam. <i>Journal of International Economics and Management</i> , 24(1), 74-88.
VNRA14	Yen, N. H., & Thanh, B. A. (2024). Financial leverage, state ownership, and firm value: the case of non-financial firms listed in Vietnam. <i>Journal of International Economics and Management</i> , 24(1), 89-102.
VNRA15	Le Quang, P., Thanh, B. A., & Phuong, N. D. (2023). Factors affecting the level of customer deposit: the case of commercial banks in Vietnam. <i>Journal of International Economics and Management</i> , 23(1), 52-69.
VNRA16	Dzung, N. V., Ngoc, H. T., Linh, M. T. K., & Van Cuong, N. (2024). Financial distress and earnings management: evidence from non-financial companies listed on the Ho Chi Minh Stock Exchange. <i>Journal of International Economics and Management</i> , 24(2), 54-72.
VNRA17	Hien, M. T. (2024). Analysis of factors affecting inflation in Vietnam during the COVID-19 pandemic. <i>Journal of International Economics and Management</i> , 24(2), 132-144.
VNRA18	Le, L. Q. (2024). Assessing the influence of corporate governance on stock return volatility in the Vietnam context. <i>Journal of International Economics and Management</i> , 24(3), 119-139.
VNRA19	Nhat, N. M., & Anh, P. N. M. (2024). The influence of diversifying income sources on the financial performance: An empirical study on Vietnamese commercial banks. <i>Journal of Finance-Marketing Research</i> , 15(5), 60-73.
VNRA20	Vo, T. T. H., & Phan, T. H. N. (2024). Factors affecting bank competitiveness during non-economic crises: A study in ASEAN countries. <i>Journal of Finance-Marketing Research</i> , 15(8), 1-14.
VNRA21	Phuong, P. T. T., Tuan, P. N., & Khoa, D. D. (2024). Innovation and bank performance in the digital transformation ERA: Evidence from Vietnam. <i>Journal of Finance-Marketing Research</i> , 15(5), 17-32.

VNRA	References
VNRA22	Phuoc, N. K., Nhu, P. N. T., & Van, T. T. T. (2023). Commercial banks listed on the Ho Chi Minh City stock exchange: An analysis of diversification, human capital, and performance. <i>Journal of Finance-Marketing Research</i> , 14(6), 58-71.
VNRA23	Le, T. D., & Pham, M. T. (2023). Influence of financial policy transmission channels on Vietnam's private economic development. <i>Journal of Finance-Marketing Research</i> , 14(6), 26-34.
VNRA24	Thuy, N. T. T., & Anh, N. P. T. (2023). An investigation of students' intention to use E-payment service in Mobile Wallet in Ho Chi Minh City. <i>Journal of Finance-Marketing Research</i> , 14(6), 96-106.
VNRA25	Nguyen, T. H. H., Pham, T. K., Ha, G. L., Nguyen, V. H. T., Nguyen, L. T., & Phung, D. A. (2024). The impact of economic policy uncertainty on firm performance in Vietnamese listed companies. <i>Journal of Economic and Banking Studies</i> , 4(2), 27-37.
VNRA26	Le, T. N. A., Nguyen, D. H., Nguyen, H. T., Nguyen, N. P. L., & Le, T. T. H. (2024). Earnings management and dividend policy of listed firms in the Ho Chi Minh City stock exchange. <i>Journal of Economic and Banking Studies</i> , 4(1), 64-79.
VNRA27	Pham, M. H., Vuong, L. N., & Nguyen, T. T. (2024). Assessing the factors affecting the Vietnamese intention to invest in cryptocurrency. <i>Journal of Economic and Banking Studies</i> , 4(2), 66-78.
VNRA28	Le, P. L., Pham, D. T., Vu, V. D., Nguyen, M. H., Tran, T. M. T., & Nguyen, T. M. H. (2024). The impact of geopolitical risk on the stock market and stock bubbles in Vietnam: a mediation model. <i>Journal of Economic and Banking Studies</i> , 4(2), 50-65.
VNRA29	Ngo, T. H., & Nguyen, T. S. (2023). Impact of capital structure on the profitability of real estate firms listed on Hanoi stock exchange amid Covid-19. <i>Journal of Economic and Banking Studies</i> , 5, 16-29.
VNRA30	Dang, H. V., & Pham, T. N. Y. (2023). Factors influence the level of career commitment among Vietnamese bankers. <i>Journal of Economic and Banking Studies</i> , 6, 37-51

30 international research articles

ELFRAs	References
ELFRA01	Yüksel, S., Eti, S., Dinçer, H., Gökalp, Y., Olaru, G. O., & Oflaz, N. K. (2025). Innovative financial solutions for sustainable investments using artificial intelligence-based hybrid fuzzy decision-making approach in carbon capture technologies. <i>Financial Innovation</i> , 11(1), 20.
ELFRA02	Mazzarano, M. (2024). Financial markets implications of the energy transition: carbon content of energy use in listed companies. <i>Financial Innovation</i> , 10(1), 33.
ELFRA03	Lu, Y. H., Yeh, C. C., & Kuo, Y. M. (2024). Exploring the critical factors affecting the adoption of blockchain: Taiwan's banking industry. <i>Financial Innovation</i> , 10(1), 23.
ELFRA04	Kaya, A., Pamucar, D., Gürler, H. E., & Ozcalici, M. (2024). Determining the financial performance of the firms in the Borsa Istanbul sustainability index: integrating multi criteria decision making methods with simulation. <i>Financial Innovation</i> , 10(1), 21.
ELFRA05	Shi, Y., Li, X., & Asal, M. (2023). Impact of sustainability on financial distress in the air transport industry: the moderating effect of Asia-Pacific. <i>Financial Innovation</i> , 9(1), 97.
ELFRA06	Chamboko, R. (2024). Digital financial services adoption: a retrospective time-to-event analysis approach. <i>Financial Innovation</i> , 10(1), 46.
ELFRA07	Al-ahdal, W. M., Muhmad, S. N., Farhan, N. H., Almaqtari, F. A., Mhawish, A., & Hashim, H. A. (2024). Unveiling the impact of firm-characteristics on sustainable development goals disclosure: a cross-country study on non-financial companies in Asia. <i>Borsa Istanbul Review</i> , 24(5), 916-933.
ELFRA08	Nadiri, A., Gündüz, V., & Adebayo, T. S. (2024). The role of financial and trade globalization in enhancing environmental sustainability: Evaluating the effectiveness of carbon taxation and renewable energy in EU member countries. <i>Borsa Istanbul Review</i> , 24(2), 235-247.
ELFRA09	Gainetdinova, A., Sohag, K., & Samargandi, N. (2024). Russian Currency's external shocks and domestic policy effectiveness amid geopolitical tensions. <i>Borsa Istanbul Review</i> , 24(2), 406-423.
ELFRA10	Bagh, T., Fuwei, J., & Khan, M. A. (2024). Corporate ESG investments and Firm's value under the real-option framework: evidence from two world-leading economies. <i>Borsa Istanbul Review</i> , 24(2), 324-340.
ELFRA11	Haruna, A., Oumbé, H. T., Kountchou, A. M., & Kakeu, C. B. P. (2024). Can Islamic finance enhance the innovation capacity of Cameroonian SMEs? Empirical evidence based on a multivariate probit approach. <i>Borsa Istanbul Review</i> , 24(1), 187-200.
ELFRA12	Damra, Y., Yasin, S., & Albaity, M. (2023). "Trust but verify" financial inclusion in the MENA region. <i>Borsa Istanbul Review</i> , 23(6), 1430-1447.

ELFRAs	References
ELFRA13	Fu, Y., & Liu, L. (2023). On the accessibility of financial services and income inequality: an international perspective. <i>Technological and Economic Development of Economy</i> , 29(3), 814-845.
ELFRA14	Ma, S. (2024). Sustainable housing development in China: does financial institutions overcome the risks and challenges to sustainable housing?. <i>Technological and Economic Development of Economy</i> , 30(3), 627-645.
ELFRA15	Liang, Y., Jin, X., & Azimzadeh, A. J. (2024). Interconnections and interdependencies of economic development and shadow banking sector in developing and transitional economies. <i>Technological and Economic Development of Economy</i> , 30(5), 1392-1411.
ELFRA16	Dumiter, F. C., Schebesch, K. B., Nicoară, Ș. A., & Bente, C. (2024). The impact of social features on the financial sustainability of pension systems in Central and Eastern Europe and Baltic States. <i>Technological and Economic Development of Economy</i> , 30(6), 1920-1949.
ELFRA17	Pei, J. (2024). Social responsibility of green microfinance institutions: A tool for promoting women's economic empowerment in China. <i>Technological and Economic Development of Economy</i> , 30(4), 876-898.
ELFRA18	Dvorský, J., Švihlíková, I., Kozubíková, L., Frajtova Michalíková, K., & Balcerzak, A. P. (2023). Effect of CSR implementation and crisis events in business on the financial management of SMEs. <i>Technological and Economic Development of Economy</i> .
ELFRA19	Bhandary, R., & Ghosh, B. K. (2025). Credit card default prediction: an empirical analysis on predictive performance using statistical and machine learning methods. <i>Journal of Risk and Financial Management</i> , 18(1), 23.
ELFRA20	Qi, J., Zhang, Y., & Ouyang, C. (2025). Cryptocurrency Investments: The role of advisory sources, investor confidence, and risk perception in shaping behaviors and intentions. <i>Journal of Risk and Financial Management</i> , 18(2), 57.
ELFRA21	Küçükçolak, R. A., Bozkurt, G., İlter Küçükçolak, N., Ertemel, A. V., & Küçüköğlu, S. (2025). Corruption control as a catalyst for financial development: a global comparative study. <i>Journal of Risk and Financial Management</i> , 18(2), 79.
ELFRA22	Alhazmi, A. H. J., Islam, S., & Prokofieva, M. (2024). The impact of changing external auditors, auditor tenure, and audit firm type on the quality of financial reports on the Saudi stock exchange. <i>Journal of Risk and Financial Management</i> , 17(9), 407.
ELFRA23	Eltweri, A., Sawan, N., Al-Hajaya, K., & Badri, Z. (2024). The influence of liquidity risk on financial performance: a study of the UK's largest commercial banks. <i>Journal of Risk and Financial Management</i> , 17(12), 580.
ELFRA24	Talavera, A., Maehara, R., Benites, L., Arriaga, B., & Aybar-Flores, A. (2024). Evaluating financial inclusion in Peru: a cluster analysis using self-organizing maps. <i>Journal of Risk and Financial Management</i> , 17(12), 549.

ELFRAs	References
ELFRA25	Lee, N. (2025). The varying impact of cryptocurrency investments on a company's liquidity in Korean companies. <i>International Journal of Financial Studies</i> , 13(1), 20.
ELFRA26	Liu, L. X., Sun, Z., Xu, K., & Chen, C. (2024). AI-driven financial analysis: Exploring ChatGPT's capabilities and challenges. <i>International Journal of Financial Studies</i> , 12(3), 60.
ELFRA27	Hanson, T. A., & Byrd, A. J. (2024). Developing a measure of financial privacy: a pilot study of US college students. <i>International Journal of Financial Studies</i> , 12(4), 116.
ELFRA28	Tawfik, O. I., Ahmed, M. A., & Elmaasrawy, H. E. (2024). The mediating role of mobile banking-based financial inclusion disclosure on the relationship between foreign investment and bank performance. <i>International Journal of Financial Studies</i> , 12(4), 128.
ELFRA29	Istaiteyeh, R., Milhem, M. A. M., Najem, F., & Elsayed, A. (2024). Determinants of operating efficiency for the Jordanian banks: A panel data econometric approach. <i>International Journal of Financial Studies</i> , 12(1), 12.
ELFRA30	Stavropoulou, E., Spinthiropoulos, K., Garefalakis, A., Ragazou, K., & Gonidakis, F. (2023). The role of social banking in the success and sustainable business continuity of SSMEs. <i>International Journal of Financial Studies</i> , 11(3), 86.

APPENDIX C

Cyclical patterns found in the Discussion sections of VNRA and ELFRA

VNRA	Cyclical pattern	ELFRA	Cyclical pattern
VNRA02	$(M20-M22)^2-M25$	ELFRA01	$(M20-M22)^3$
VNRA03	$(M20-M22)^5-M20$	ELFRA02	$(M19-M20-M22)^2-(M20-M22)^3-M25-M24-M25$
VNRA04	$M19-M21-M20-M22-M25-M20-M22-M20-M25$	ELFRA03	$M24-(M20-M22)^2-M20-M24-M20-M22-M24$
VNRA05	$M19-M20-M22-M25-M20-M25$	ELFRA04	$M19-(M20-M22)^2-M19-M20-M22-M25$
VNRA06	$(M20-M22)^3-M20$	ELFRA05	$M19-M20-M22$
VNRA07	$M20-M22-(M19-M20-M22)^3$	ELFRA06	$(M20-M22)^5-M22-M25-(M20-M22)^4-M25-M22$
VNRA08	$M20-M22-M19-M20-M22-M24-M25$	ELFRA07	$M24-M20-M22-M21-(M20-M22)^7-M25-M24$
VNRA09	$M19-(M20-M22)^3-M19-M20-M22-M24-M25-M24$	ELFRA09	$(M20-M22)^3-M24-(M20-M22)^3-M19-M20-M22$
VNRA10	$(M19-M20)^2-M22-M20-M22$	ELFRA10	$M19-M24-M21-M22$
VNRA11	$(M20-M22)^3$	ELFRA11	$M19-(M20-M22)^2-(M19-M20-M22)^2-(M19-M20)^2-M22-M19-M20$
VNRA12	$M19-(M20-M22)^6$	ELFRA12	$M19-(M20-M22)^3-M25$
VNRA13	$(M22-M25)^2-M20-M22-M25$	ELFRA13	$(M19-M20)^2-M22-M25-(M20-M22)^3-(M19-M20-M22)^2-M19-M20-M24-M19-M20-M22-M20-M25-M19-M20-M22-M25$
VNRA14	$(M19-M20-M22)^2-(M19-M20)^2$	ELFRA14	$M25$
VNRA15	$(M20-M22)^7$	ELFRA17	$M24-(M20-M22)^2-M25-M22$
VNRA16	$M20-M22-M24-M22-(M20-M22)^5$	ELFRA18	$M19-(M20-M22)^8$
VNRA17	$(M20-M22)^8$	ELFRA19	$(M20-M22)^6-M21-M22-M20-M22-M25$
VNRA18	$M19-(M20-M22)^4-M19-M20-M25-(M20-M22)^4-M25$	ELFRA20	$M19-(M20-M22)^3-M20-M22-M24-(M20-M22)^3-M24-M22-M24-(M20-M22)^2-M24-M22-M24-(M20-M22)^2-M24-M25$
VNRA19	$M19-M24-(M20-M22)^4-M20$	ELFRA21	$(M20-M22)^2-M24-M25$
VNRA20	$M20-M22-M19-M22-(M20-M22)^7-M19-(M20-M22)^4$	ELFRA22	$M19-M22-M19-M22-M19-M22-M22$
VNRA22	$(M20-M22)^{11}$	ELFRA23	$(M20-M19)^2-M22-(M20-M19)^2-M22$
VNRA22	$(M20-M22)^3$	ELFRA24	$M19-(M20-M19)^2-M22-M19-M20-M19$
VNRA23	$M19-(M20-M22)^5$	ELFRA27	$M19-(M20-M19)^5-M18-M22-M22$
VNRA24	$M19-(M20-M22)^5$		$M19-M20-M22-M22-M19-M22-M19-M22$
VNRA25	$M19-(M20-M22)^3$	ELFRA28	$M19-M22$
VNRA26	$M19-(M20-M22)^6$		$M19-(M20-M19)^2-M22-(M20-M19)^2$
VNRA27	$(M19-M20-M22)^3-M25-M20-M22-M20-M25-M19-M20-M22$		
VNRA28	$(M20-M22)^3-M24-M25$		
VNRA29	$M19-(M20-M22)^6$		
VNRA30	$M20-M22-M20-M25$		

The superscript means that the pattern in the parentheses occur x times (x = the superscript number)

APPENDIX D
Moves and Steps of VNRAs

Section (N=30)	Move and Step	%	Status
Introduction	Move 1: Establishing a territory	100%	Obligatory
	M1S1: Claiming centrality	80%	Conventional
	M1S2: Making topic generalization	77%	Conventional
	M1S3: Reviewing previous studies	83.33%	Conventional
	M1S4: Summarizing previous studies	16.67%	Optional
	Move 2: Establishing a niche	83.33%	Conventional
	M2S1: Indicating problems	50%	Optional
	M2S2: Indicating gaps	56.67%	Optional
	M2S3: Adding to what is known	16.67%	Optional
	M2S4: Presenting positive justification	46.67%	Optional
	Move 3: Presenting the present study	93.33%	Conventional
	M3S1: Announcing present research descriptively and /or purposively	86.67%	Conventional
	M3S2: Presenting research questions or hypotheses	3.33%	Optional
	M3S3: Describing the sample	10%	Optional
	M3S4: Summarizing methods	33.33%	Optional
	M3S5: Justifying methods	6.67%	Optional
	M3S6: Announcing principal outcomes	10%	Optional
	M3S7: Stating the value of the present research	60%	Conventional
	M3S8: Outlining the structure of the paper	63.33%	Conventional
Literature Review	Move 4: Establishing one part of the territory	100%	Obligatory
	M4S1: Claiming centrality	23.33%	Optional
	M4S2: Surveying the non-research-related phenomena or knowledge claims	86.67%	Conventional
	M4S3: Surveying the research-related phenomena	96.67%	Conventional
	M4S4: Summarising the research-related phenomena	36.67%	Optional
	Move 5: Creating a research niche	63.33%	Conventional
	M5S1: Counter-claiming	6.67%	Optional
	M5S2: Gap-indicating	26.67%	Optional
	M5S3: Asserting confirmative claims	3.33%	Optional
	M5S4: Abstracting or synthesizing knowledge claims to establish a theoretical position or a theoretical framework	53.33%	Optional
	Move 6: Occupying the research niche	86.67%	Conventional

Section (N=30)	Move and Step	%	Status
Methods	M6S1: Research aims, focuses, research questions or hypotheses	70%	Conventional
	M6S2: Theoretical positions/theoretical frameworks	33.33%	Optional
	M6S3: Research design/processes	13.33%	Optional
	Move 7: Presenting hypotheses	10%	Optional
	Move 8: Describing research model(s)	76.67%	Conventional
	M8S1: Justifying research model(s)	60%	Conventional
	M8S2: Presenting research model(s)	76.67%	Conventional
	Move 9: Describing data collection procedure(s)	96.67%	Conventional
	M9S1: Describing the sample	96.67%	Conventional
	(a) Describing the location of the sample	63.33%	Conventional
	(b) Describing the size of the sample/population	86.67%	Conventional
	(c) Describing the characteristics of the sample	80%	Conventional
	(d) Describing the sampling technique or criterion	60%	Conventional
	M9S2: Recounting steps in data collection	30%	Optional
	M9S3: Justifying the data collection procedure(s)	6.67%	Optional
	(a) Highlighting advantages of using the sample	3.33%	Optional
	(b) Showing representativity of the sample	3.33%	Optional
	Move 10: Delineating procedure(s) for measuring variables	83.33%	Conventional
	M10S1: Presenting an overview of the design	23.33%	Optional
	M10S2: Explaining method(s) of measuring variables	80%	Conventional
	(a) Specifying items in questionnaires/databases	13.33%	Optional
	(b) Defining variables	33.33%	Optional
	(c) Describing methods of measuring variables	70%	Conventional
	M10S3: Justifying the method(s) of measuring variables	20%	Optional
	(a) Citing previous research method(s)	20%	Optional
	(b) Highlighting acceptability of the method(s)	6.67%	Optional

Section (N=30)	Move and Step	%	Status
	Move 11: Elucidating data analysis procedure(s)	23.33%	Conventional
	M11S1: Relating (or 'recounting') data analysis procedure(s)	20%	Optional
	M11S2: Justifying the data analysis procedure(s)	3.33%	Optional
	M11S3: Previewing results	6.67%	Optional
Results	Move 12: Preparatory information	100%	Obligatory
	Move 13: Reporting results	100%	Obligatory
	Move 14: Commenting on results	93.33%	Conventional
	M14S1: Interpreting results	83.33%	Conventional
	M14S2: Comparing results with literature	23.33%	Optional
	M14S3: Evaluating results	20%	Optional
	M14S4: Accounting for results	23.33%	Optional
	Move 15: Disproving alternative explanations	3.33%	Optional
	M15S1: Describing process of changing a research condition	3.33%	Optional
	M15S2: Describing results of changing a research condition	3.33%	Optional
	M15S3: Interpreting results of changing a research condition	3.33%	Optional
	Move 16: Summarizing results	0%	Optional
	Move 17: Evaluating the study	3.33%	Optional
	M17S1: Indicating limitations	3.33%	Optional
	M17S2: Indicating significance/advantage	0%	Optional
	Move 18: Deductions from the research	6.67%	Optional
Discussion	Move 19: Background information	56.67%	Optional
	Move 20: Reporting results	100%	Obligatory
	Move 21: Summarizing results	3.33%	Optional
	Move 22: Commenting on results	100%	Obligatory
	M22S1: Interpreting results	80%	Conventional
	M22S2: Comparing results with literature	90%	Conventional
	M22S3: Accounting for results	73.33%	Conventional
	M22S4: Evaluating results	23.33%	Optional
	Move 23: Summarizing the study	0%	Optional
	Move 24: Evaluating the study	13.33%	Optional
	M24S1: Indicating limitations	6.67%	Optional
	M24S2: Indicating significance/advantage	10%	Optional
	M24S3: Evaluating methodology	0%	Optional
	Move 25: Deductions from the research	30%	Optional
	M25S1: Making suggestions	13.33%	Optional

Section (N=30)	Move and Step	%	Status
	M25S2: Recommending further research	10%	Optional
	M25S3: Drawing implications	13.33%	Optional
Conclusion	Move 26: Summarizing the study	90%	Conventional
	M26S1: Restating background	6.67%	Optional
	M26S2: Restating objectives	66.67%	Conventional
	M26S3: Restating methodology	40%	Optional
	M26S4: Restating findings	93.33%	Conventional
	Move 27: Evaluating the study	56.67%	Optional
	M27S1: Indicating significance	43.33%	Optional
	M27S2: Indicating limitations	20%	Optional
	M27S3: Evaluating methodology	6.67%	Optional
	Move 28: Deducing from the study	96.67%	Conventional
	M28S1: Recommending further studies	46.67%	Optional
	M28S2: Drawing implications	86.67%	Conventional

APPENDIX E

The comparison of the move-step structure between VNRAs and ELFRA

Section	Status	VNRA	ELFRA
Introduction	Obligatory (100%)	Move 1: Establishing a territory	
	Conventional (60%-99%)		Move 1: Establishing a territory
		M1S1: Claiming centrality	M1S1: Claiming centrality
		M1S2: Making topic generalization*	M1S2: Making topic generalization*
		M1S3: Reviewing previous studies*	M1S3: Reviewing previous studies*
		Move 2: Establishing a niche	Move 2: Establishing a niche
			M2S2: Indicating gaps
		Move 3: Presenting the present study	Move 3: Presenting the present study
		M3S1: Announcing present research descriptively and /or purposively	M3S1: Announcing present research descriptively and /or purposively
		M3S7: Stating the value of the present research	M3S7: Stating the value of the present research
	Optional (<60%)	M3S8: Outlining the structure of the paper	M3S8: Outlining the structure of the paper
		M1S4: Summarizing previous studies	M1S4: Summarizing previous studies
		M2S1: Indicating problems	M2S1: Indicating problems
		M2S2: Indicating gaps	
		M2S3: Adding to what is known	M2S3: Adding to what is known
		M2S4: Presenting positive justification	M2S4: Presenting positive justification
		M3S2: Presenting research questions or hypotheses*	M3S2: Presenting research questions or hypotheses*
		M3S3: Describe the sample	M3S3: Describe the sample
		M3S4: Summarizing methods	M3S4: Summarizing methods
		M3S5: Justifying methods	M3S5: Justifying methods
		M3S6: Announcing principal outcomes	M3S6: Announcing principal outcomes
Literature Review	Obligatory (100%)	Move 4: Establishing one part of the territory	Move 4: Establishing one part of the territory
	Conventional (60%-99%)	M4S2: Surveying the non-research-related phenomena or knowledge claims	M4S2: Surveying the non-research-related phenomena or knowledge claims
		M4S3: Surveying the research-related phenomena	M4S3: Surveying the research-related phenomena
		Move 5: Creating a research niche	Move 5: Creating a research niche
		Move 6: Occupying the research niche	Move 6: Occupying the research niche
		M6S1: Research aims, focuses, research questions or hypotheses	M6S1: Research aims, focuses, research questions or hypotheses
	Optional (<60%)	M4S1: Claiming centrality*	M4S1: Claiming centrality*
		M4S4: Summarising the research-related phenomena	M4S4: Summarising the research-related phenomena
		M5S1: Counter-claiming	M5S1: Counter-claiming
		M5S2: Gap-indicating*	M5S2: Gap-indicating*

Section	Status	VNRAs	ELFRAs
		M5S3: Asserting confirmative claims	M5S3: Asserting confirmative claims
		M5S4: Abstracting or synthesizing knowledge claims to establish a theoretical position or a theoretical framework	M5S4: Abstracting or synthesizing knowledge claims to establish a theoretical position or a theoretical framework
		M6S2: Theoretical positions/theoretical frameworks*	M6S2: Theoretical positions/theoretical frameworks*
		M6S3: Research design/processes	M6S3: Research design/processes
Methods	Obligatory (100%)		Move 10: Delineating procedure(s) for measuring variables*
	Conventional (60%-99%)	Move 8: Describing research model(s)	Move 8: Describing research model(s)
		M8S1: Justifying research model(s)	
		M8S2: Presenting research model(s)	M8S2: Presenting research model(s)
		Move 9: Describing data collection procedure(s)	Move 9: Describing data collection procedure(s)
		M9S1: Describing the sample	M9S1: Describing the sample
		Move 10: Delineating procedure(s) for measuring variables*	
		M10S2: Explaining method(s) of measuring variables*	M10S2: Explaining method(s) of measuring variables*
	Optional (<60%)	Move 7: Presenting hypotheses*	Move 7: Presenting hypotheses*
		M8S1: Justifying research model(s)	M8S1: Justifying research model(s)
		M9S2: Recounting steps in data collection	M9S2: Recounting steps in data collection
		M9S3: Justifying the data collection procedure(s)	M9S3: Justifying the data collection procedure(s)
		M10S1: Presenting an overview of the design*	M10S1: Presenting an overview of the design*
		M10S3: Justifying the method(s) of measuring variables	M10S3: Justifying the method(s) of measuring variables
		Move 11: Elucidating data analysis procedure(s)	Move 11: Elucidating data analysis procedure(s)
		M11S1: Relating (or 'recounting') data analysis procedure(s)	M11S1: Relating (or 'recounting') data analysis procedure(s)
		M11S2: Justifying the data analysis procedure(s)	M11S2: Justifying the data analysis procedure(s)
		M11S3: Previewing results	M11S3: Previewing results
Results	Obligatory (100%)	Move 12: Preparatory information	
		Move 13: Reporting results	Move 13: Reporting results
	Conventional (60%-99%)	Move 14: Commenting on results	Move 12: Preparatory information
		M14S1: Interpreting results	Move 14: Commenting on results
			M14S1: Interpreting results
	Optional (<60%)		M14S2: Comparing results with literature
		M14S2: Comparing results with literature	
		M14S3: Evaluating results	M14S3: Evaluating results

Section	Status	VNRAs	ELFRAs
		M14S4: Accounting for results Move 15: Disproving alternative explanations* M15S1: Describing process of changing a research condition* M15S2: Describing results of changing a research condition* M15S3: Interpreting results of changing a research condition* Move 16: Summarizing results Move 17: Evaluating the study M17S1: Indicating limitations M17S2: Indicating significance/advantage Move 18: Deductions from the research	M14S4: Accounting for results Move 15: Disproving alternative explanations* M15S1: Describing process of changing a research condition* M15S2: Describing results of changing a research condition* M15S3: Interpreting results of changing a research condition* Move 16: Summarizing results Move 17: Evaluating the study M17S1: Indicating limitations M17S2: Indicating significance/advantage Move 18: Deductions from the research
Discussion	Obligatory (100%)	Move 20: Reporting results* Move 22: Commenting on results	
	Conventional (60%-99%)	M22S1: Interpreting results M22S2: Comparing results with literature M22S3: Accounting for results*	Move 19: Background information Move 20: Reporting results* Move 22: Commenting on results M22S1: Interpreting results M22S2: Comparing results with literature Move 24: Evaluating the study* Move 25: Deductions from the research*
	Optional (<60%)	Move 19: Background information Move 21: Summarizing results M22S4: Evaluating results* Move 23: Summarizing the study Move 24: Evaluating the study* M24S1: Indicating limitations M24S2: Indicating significance/advantage* M24S3: Evaluating methodology Move 25: Deductions from the research* M25S1: Making suggestions M25S2: Recommending further research* M25S3: Drawing implications	Move 21: Summarizing results M22S3: Accounting for results* M22S4: Evaluating results* M24S1: Indicating limitations M24S2: Indicating significance/advantage* M24S3: Evaluating methodology M25S1: Making suggestions M25S2: Recommending further research* M25S3: Drawing implications
Conclusion	Obligatory (100%)		Move 26: Summarizing the study* Move 28: Deducing from the study

Section	Status	VNRAs	ELFRAs
	Conventional (60%-99%)	Move 26: Summarizing the study* M26S2: Restating objectives M26S4: Restating findings Move 28: Deducting from the study M28S2: Drawing implications*	M26S2: Restating objectives M26S3: Restating methodology* M26S4: Restating findings Move 27: Evaluating the study* M27S2: Indicating limitations* M28S1: Recommending further studies* M28S2: Drawing implications*
	Optional (<60%)	M26S1: Restating background* M26S3: Restating methodology* Move 27: Evaluating the study* M27S1: Indicating significance M27S2: Indicating limitations* M27S3: Evaluating methodology M28S1: Recommending further studies*	M26S1: Restating background* M27S1: Indicating significance M27S3: Evaluating methodology

*: statistically significant difference